# Comments of the Independent Peer-Review Team for the Great Plains Regional Supplement to the 1987 Corps of Engineers Wetland Delineation Manual, and Responses by the Corps of Engineers and Great Plains Working Group

Comments and recommendations developed by the peer-review team are given in Columns B through F of Sheet 1 (see tabs below). Column A is a sequential item number. Responses shown in Column G were developed by the US Army Engineer Research and Development Center (ERDC) in cooperation with the Great Plains Working Group.

The Corps of Engineers wishes to thank all reviewers for their helpful and well-reasoned comments.

| Item # | Reviewer         | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|--------|------------------|------|-----------|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        | Talleto          |      |           |          | General comment - this supplement provides myriad ways in which an area, potentially a non-wetland area, could satisfy wetland parameters.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | We strongly disagree. Nonwetland areas may sometimes exhibit indicators of one or even two of the essential wetland characteristics hydrophytic vegetation, hydric soil, and wetland hydrology. However, all three factors are required for an area to be identified as a wetland. The three-factor approach has been used successfully to identify wetlands in the Great Plains since the publication of the 1987 Manual. This supplement does not change the basic requirement for all three factors described in the 1987 Manual. |
| 1      | Trilety<br>Wade  | 0    |           |          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 7                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 2      | Barbi<br>Hayes   | 0    |           |          | Keep in mind many delineators have a one time look at a parcel of land.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | The supplement was designed to identify wetlands accurately based on a single site visit.  Only rarely would an investigator need to return for additional information.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 3      | Barbi<br>Hayes   | 0    |           |          | Science does not have to be a complex process. Keeping something simple can be a good thing.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 4      | Barbi<br>Hayes   | 0    |           |          | When analyzing data remember that the farther away you get from your raw data - the farther away you get from the truth.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 5      | Barbi<br>Hayes   | 0    |           |          | There is a fountain of good information in this supplement - but - other parts of it are far too reflective of the 1989 Manual. Procedurally, that is just wrong.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 6      | Gregory          | 0    |           |          | The hydrophytic vegetation section makes mention of conducting delineations when snow and ice are present, but winter delineations are not addressed under hydric soils. Oftentimes the soils are frozen solid and it is not possible to excavate a soil pit. When it is absolutely necessary to do a delineation under these conditions we get the client and Corps to agree that wetland determinations will be made based primarily on the presence of hydrophytic vegetation supplemented by any evidence of hydrology visible on the surface. | Winter botany provides special challenges because plants may be absent or unidentifiable, making hydrophytic vegetation decisions impossible. We agree that frozen ground may hamper soil sampling as well. To meet their time constraints, Districts have the authority to make wetland decisions based on the best information that is available at the time.                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 7      | Frank<br>Norman  | 0    |           |          | CHAPTERS 3 & 4 - Not any substantive comments as both chapters are well written and researched. Great to have all these hydrologic indicators included, spelled out, and photographed. Should make wetland delineations as simple as rocket science.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| Ω      | Stephen<br>Parke | 0    |           |          | Overall: Very commendable clarification on use of the 1987 Manual in this region.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 9      | James<br>Jones   | 1    | 1         | 3        | "based on a three-factor approach <i>involving</i> indicators" replace involving with requiring. The whole premis of the Manual is meeting all three criteria; the 1989 manual was thrown out for trying to not require all three.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | No change is needed. The 1987 Manual and this supplement are already clear on the proper application of the 3-factor approach, including certain highly disturbed or problematic wetland situations that may lack indicators of one or more factors (see Sections F and G of the 1987 Manual).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 10     | James<br>Jones   | 1    | 2         | 3        | Change "cannot be considered" to "are difficult to consider". I think the wording is too strong. An experienced delineator that understands the Manual can and does account for these differences in the field.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | The statement in the supplement is true that a single manual cannot address regional differences in environmental and wetland conditions adequately. It does not say that experienced delineators have not considered these issues in applying the manual. No change is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 11     | Barbi<br>Hayes   | 1    | 2         | 5        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | It is true that any change in methods could result in a change in the wetland boundary on a particular site. However, we believe that the supplement will have no net effect on wetland boundaries in the region. We expect no change in overall jurisdictional reach.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|        | Barbi<br>Hayes   | 1    | 2         | 7 (last) | This sounds like a caveat for situations such as isolated wetlands. If so, it is an important statement and should not be buried at the end of a paragraph.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Our intent is to indicate that jurisdiction is a two-part test; determining if the area has the three wetland factors and then whether or not it is regulated by policy. This supplement does not address jurisdictional policy.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

| Item # | Reviewer           | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                       | Response                                                                                                                    |
|--------|--------------------|------|-----------|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |                    |      |           |          | Concerning the relationship of the supplements to the 1987                                                                    | We are evaluating the need to edit and republish the 1987 Corps Wetland Delineation                                         |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Manual, I understand that the supplements trump the 1987                                                                      | Manual after all of the regional supplements are completed.                                                                 |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Manual. However, I recommend that unchanged parts of the 87                                                                   |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Manual be edited for consistency with the supplements. There                                                                  |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | are numerous examples of outdated language in the unchanged                                                                   |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | parts of the 1987 Manual that have been updated with the                                                                      |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | supplement. As an example, Section 54 (c) of the 87 Manual                                                                    |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | concerning soil surveys has been updated thru the supplement. I                                                               |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | would favor the redundancy of having similar language in the                                                                  |                                                                                                                             |
|        | _                  |      |           |          | supplement and the unchanged part of the 87 Manual, rather than                                                               |                                                                                                                             |
|        | Greg               |      | _         | _        | have new language in the supplement and old language in the                                                                   |                                                                                                                             |
| 13     | Larson             | 1    | 3         | 2        | 1987 Manual.                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          |                                                                                                                               | Use of this or any other supplement is dictated by whether the area to be evaluated is                                      |
|        |                    |      |           |          | quite a large area, maybe too large for this supplement. Portions                                                             | consistent with the description of the region. The working group believes that the                                          |
|        | Barbi              | •    | •         |          | of the Black Hills are excluded. I question that this is the only                                                             | supplement is applicable throughout the Great Plains Region. However, some indicators, as                                   |
| 14     | Hayes              | 2    | 2         |          | area that should be excluded.                                                                                                 | noted in the supplement, are applicable only to particular subregions.                                                      |
|        | Crogon             |      |           |          | There are other relatively large areas of Ponderosa Pine such as                                                              | If the Pine Bluffs meet the concept of the Western Mountains, Valleys & Coast Regional                                      |
| 4.5    | Gregory            | 4    |           |          | the Pine Bluffs in southeast Wyoming that could be excluded                                                                   | Supplement, then it should be used in place of the Great Plains supplement. Application of                                  |
|        | Johnson<br>Gregory | 4    |           |          | abanga "impartant" ta "aamman"                                                                                                | a particular supplement is not based solely on map location.                                                                |
|        | Johnson            | 6    | 4         | 5        | change "important" to "common"                                                                                                | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                        |
| 10     | Gregory            | 0    | 4         | J        | eliminate comma between "rushes" and (Juncus)                                                                                 | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                        |
| 17     | Johnson            | 7    | 4         | 2        |                                                                                                                               | will make the recommended change.                                                                                           |
|        | Gregory            |      |           |          | change "important" to "common"                                                                                                | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                        |
| 18     | Johnson            | 8    | 3         | 8        | onange important to common                                                                                                    | will make the recommended change.                                                                                           |
|        | Barbi              |      |           |          | This paragraph brings up some very good points.                                                                               | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed.                                                                     |
| 19     | Hayes              | 10   | 3         |          |                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | What is not say the areas that were at one time wetland that are                                                              | True. But this statement is just reiterating the FACU percentages as given by Reed (1988).                                  |
|        |                    |      |           |          | now dominated by primarily FACU species is not an area that is                                                                | Also, because wetlands must have indicators of all three factors (hydrophytic vegetation,                                   |
|        |                    |      |           |          | converting to upland. In addition, the same argument can be                                                                   | hydric soils, and wetland hydrology), a nonwetland area with a hydrophytic plant community                                  |
|        |                    |      |           |          | made for uplands where predominately wetland species are                                                                      | would not be mistaken for a wetland.                                                                                        |
| 00     | James              | 44   | 0         | _        | present (i.e. phreatophytes).                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                             |
| 20     | Jones              | 11   | 2         | 3        | If EACH and sing one deminate watered areas there it should be                                                                | Two Dut again it is a three featurest An unland area deminated by those analisa would                                       |
|        |                    |      |           |          | If FACU species can dominate wetland areas, then it should be understood FACW species such as <i>Phalaris arundinacea</i> and | True. But, again, it is a three-factor test. An upland area dominated by these species would not be mistaken for a wetland. |
|        | Trilety            |      |           |          | Alliara petiolata can invade and dominate upland areas and                                                                    | Thor be mistaken for a welland.                                                                                             |
| 21     | Wade               | 11   | 2         | 3&4      | upland wooded areas.                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                             |
|        | Wade               |      |           | - OQ-7   | I have huge problems with the content of this paragraph. If                                                                   | The reviewer is correct that FACW species, by definition, also occur in nonwetlands up to                                   |
|        |                    |      |           |          | dominated by FACU species then probably not adapted to                                                                        | 33% of the time. However, these situations would not be mistaken for wetlands due to the                                    |
|        |                    |      |           |          | anaerobic conditions. Sounds like you are trying to broaden the                                                               | additional requirement for indicators of hydric soils and wetland hydrology. In the same way,                               |
|        |                    |      |           |          | scope of the vegetation parameter. And if you are going to say                                                                | FACU species occur in wetlands up to 33% of the time. On rare occasions, they may                                           |
|        |                    |      |           |          | there is a probability that FACU could indicate a wetland then you                                                            | dominate a wetland causing it to fail the basic hydrophytic vegetation test (dominance test).                               |
|        |                    |      |           |          | also have to look at the flip side of that - being that several                                                               | The effort here is to identify these problematic wetland situations based on the presence of                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          | species categorized as FACW are just as often found in non                                                                    | hydric soils, wetland hydrology, and other evidence that the plant community is adapted to                                  |
|        | Barbi              |      |           |          | wetland areas such as reed canary grass and garlic mustard (R5).                                                              | saturated soil conditions. If this evidence is lacking, then the area is not a wetland.                                     |
| 22     | Hayes              | 11   | 2         | all      |                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                             |
|        |                    |      |           |          | it should be stated that wetland plants are limited to rooted                                                                 | Because of seasonal shifts in the occurrence of surface water, this may not always be true.                                 |
|        |                    |      |           |          | emergents and do not include submerged aquatics                                                                               | In any case, wetland delineation focuses on the upper boundary of the wetland. Distinctions                                 |
|        | Gregory            |      |           |          |                                                                                                                               | between wetland emergents and submerged aquatics are not important to the determination.                                    |
| 23     | Johnson            | 11   | 2         |          |                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                             |
|        | Greg               |      |           |          | I favor a stronger reference to Chapter 5. Parts of this chapter                                                              | Chapter 5 is adequately referenced.                                                                                         |
| 24     | Larson             | 11   | 3         |          | are better understood in the context of Chapter 5.                                                                            |                                                                                                                             |

| Item # | Reviewer           | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                                    | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--------|--------------------|------|-----------|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |                    |      |           |          | I like the professional ability to be flexible and find a "balance"                        | The 1987 Manual and this supplement provide for flexibility to adapt sampling procedures to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        | James              |      |           |          | depending on the project scale and feasibility.                                            | the site. Plots sizes and other suggestions are given as examples and are optional.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 25     | Jones              | 11   | 4         | NA       |                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Does the 5% total plant cover rule also apply to monitoring                                | Monitoring of mitigation success is potentially very different from wetland delineation and                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |                    |      |           |          | created wetlands? Although not common (there are usually                                   | should not necessarily use the same criteria or thresholds. It is not the role of this                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        |                    |      |           |          | performance standards for mitigation sites) I have been involved                           | supplement to provide wetland performance standards, which are at the District's discretion.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        |                    |      |           |          | in a few projects where the ACOE directed me to map any areas                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          | that meet all 3 criteria as successful wetland creation on                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Gregory            |      |           |          | mitigation sites. It seems perhaps a higher standard should be in                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 26     | Johnson            | 11   | 5         | 8        | place for mitigation sites.                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Vegetated if 5 percent + total cover. This seems like an arbitrary                         | We agree with all of these statements. However, the working group's goal was to provide                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        |                    |      |           |          | number. Total cover ranges from complete cover to no cover.                                | some consistency between different delineators and districts in the way wetland                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          |                                                                                            | determinations are made within the region. Wet areas with less than 5% plant cover are not                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|        |                    |      |           |          | will vary by season.                                                                       | ignored, they are delineated using slightly different methods (see Chapter 5).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|        | Barbi              |      | _         |          |                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 27     | Hayes              | 11   | 5         | last     |                                                                                            | THE RESERVE THE RE |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Anything but the graduated single plot method, based on my field                           | The working group considered similar issues when making its recommendations. We agree                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|        |                    |      |           |          | experience, would greatly extend field time and should only be                             | that the graduated-plot approach is often the most efficient way to gather repeatable data                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|        |                    |      |           |          | considered in problem (i.e. after-the-fact delineations) or sensitive                      | sets. However, this approach is not necessarily applicable in all situations and investigators                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|        |                    |      |           |          | projects. If another method is to be used, then they need to be                            | need the flexibility to adapt to site conditions.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|        | James              |      |           |          | standardized and not allowed to be "adaptable" or "adjustable"                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 28     | Jones              | 11   | 5         | NA       | because this opens the door for biasness.                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 20     | James              | - 11 | 5         | INA      | Randomness should always be used with the nested plot method                               | We will add the recommendation that quadrats should be randomly distributed within the                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 29     | Jones              | 12   | 3         | NA       | to reduce bias.                                                                            | larger plot.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 23     | James              | 12   |           | 14/1     | I like the boundaries placed on strata, which leaves no doubt to                           | No response is necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 30     | Jones              | 14   | 1         | Section  | the investigator what to evaluate.                                                         | The respondent mesessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        |                    |      |           |          | I have a problem calling any plant with 5% cover a dominant just                           | We understand the reviewer's concern. However, there is no one approach that seems to fit                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        |                    |      |           |          | because it is in a separate stratum. A shrub with only 5% cover                            | all plant communities perfectly, and allowing individuals the flexibility to alter the rules for                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|        |                    |      |           |          | should not be treated any differently than a grass or forb that has                        | each site would result in arbitrary and inconsistent decisions. The working group                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|        |                    |      |           |          | only 5% cover. More emphasis should be put on herbaceous                                   | recommended this approach as the best compromise.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|        |                    |      |           |          | layer than trees or shrubs because the herbaceous layer is the                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Gregory            |      |           |          | best indicator of hydrology close to the soil surface.                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 31     | Johnson            | 15   | 1         | 4        |                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Barbi              |      |           |          | I like separating short shrubs and herbaceous plants.                                      | No response is necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 32     | Hayes              | 15   | 1         |          |                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          | Stratum defined as percent cover - if has even one species in                              | It is considered, but only if that species has at least 5% cover. The supplement's approach                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |                    |      |           |          | stratum - that stratum should be considered.                                               | prevents sparse strata (<5% cover) from being treated equally to those with, say, 20% or                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|        |                    |      |           |          |                                                                                            | greater cover. Again, the working group felt that the 5% threshold was an appropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|        | Barbi              |      |           |          |                                                                                            | compromise that would increase the consistency of wetland decisions.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 33     | Hayes              | 15   | 1         |          | TI 4007                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |                    |      |           |          | The 1987 manual was written for conducting delineations during                             | Wetland delineations are performed at all times of year as necessary to meet the Districts'                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |                    |      |           |          | the growing season. By having a paragraph on how to conduct                                | time constraints on permit decisions. There is nothing in the 1987 Manual that restricts                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|        |                    |      |           |          | delineations when there is snow and ice contradicts this premise.                          | delineations to the growing season, and most wetland indicators could be evaluated at any                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        |                    |      |           |          | There should be a strongly worded statement that delineations                              | time of year. This section acknowledges the difficulties involved in some winter delineations                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|        | Gragon             |      |           |          | should be conducted during the growing season if at all possible                           | and gives alternative approaches, if needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 24     | Gregory<br>Johnson | 15   | 2         |          | and that delineations during winter are strongly discouraged as a preface to this section. |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 34     | James              | 10   |           |          | l'                                                                                         | We agree. That is the plan in the near future.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 25     | Jones              | 15   | Last      |          | match the regions used for each regional supplement.                                       | That is the plan in the hear luttire.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 33     | 201162             | 10   | Lasi      | l        | maton the regions used for each regional supplement.                                       | I                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

| Item # | Reviewer | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                        | Response                                                                                          |
|--------|----------|------|-----------|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |          |      |           |          | Snow and Ice: A statement should be added that directs                                                                         | This is a District decision, and likely would vary from District to District given the great      |
|        | Greg     |      |           |          | delineators to the Corps District for specific guidance on the                                                                 | climatic differences from north to south in the region.                                           |
| 36     | 6 Larson | 15   |           |          | conduct of delineations done outside the growing season.                                                                       |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | Sounds like you are trying to bring back the two-parameter                                                                     | The 1987 Manual lists six indicators of hydrophytic vegetation. The regional supplement           |
|        |          |      |           |          | version of the 1989 proposed manual such that if there are hydric                                                              | expands only slightly on this list by adding the prevalence index, and actually drops or          |
|        |          |      |           |          | soils and indicators of wetland hydrology - then the vegetation                                                                | makes more stringent some of the remaining indicators from the 1987 Manual. The                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | must be hydrophytic - and if the typical vegetation test fails - then                                                          | sequential procedure on page 17 of the supplement is not intended to cast a wider net to          |
|        |          |      |           |          | you will continue to "test" and "test" until you get the result of                                                             | capture more communities as hydrophytic than was done in the 1987 Manual. Rather, the             |
|        |          |      |           |          | positive for vegetation. I am uncomfortable with trying to resurrect                                                           | procedure is intended to reduce the delineator's effort in the field by requiring only one        |
|        |          |      |           |          | those debates and/or that manual with this supplement. I do not                                                                | vegetation test (the dominance test) in the majority of determinations. The investigator          |
|        |          |      |           |          | believe that is the purpose of this supplement. We should be                                                                   | would evaluate the other two, more complicated indicators (prevalence index and                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | applying the "KISS" method - keep it simple                                                                                    | morphological adaptations) only if indicators of hydric soils and wetland hydrology were          |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                | present. If the procedure were not made sequential, then the delineator would need to             |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                | evaluate all three hydrophytic vegetation indicators on every site. This sequential procedure     |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                | does not reduce to a two-factor wetland test. Indicators of all three factors are needed to       |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                | make the wetland determination, except in certain Atypical Situations or Problem Areas as de      |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                   |
|        | Barbi    |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                   |
| 31     | 7 Hayes  | 17   | 1         |          | At first 14h such to see his some life to see the first see his see                                                            | W/s amaza Osa tha massissa manaza                                                                 |
|        |          |      |           |          | At first, I thought applying multiple vegetation analyses because                                                              | We agree. See the previous response.                                                              |
|        |          |      |           |          | plants failed the dominance test was just looking for ways to make                                                             |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | an area wetland, but not I understand this is strictly when                                                                    |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | hydrology and soils are present are no doubt present. If for some reason an area fails the vegetation dominance test and your  |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                                                                                          |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | professional "gut" tells you this is a wetland due to the soils and hydrology then I agree that the veg should be more closely |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | analyzed with additional methods. Professional judgement should                                                                |                                                                                                   |
|        | James    |      |           |          | be the primary drive however and not just because the plants                                                                   |                                                                                                   |
| 38     | 3 Jones  | 17   | 1         |          | failed the dominance test.                                                                                                     |                                                                                                   |
|        | 5 001100 |      |           |          | The new procedure prescribed for vegetation does not fit the                                                                   | We agree that, in the future, the 1987 Manual should be edited in light of the new                |
|        |          |      |           |          | process flowcharts given in the methods part of the unchanged                                                                  | supplements. For now, except as noted in Table 1, the supplement will simply augment the          |
|        |          |      |           |          | 1987 Manual. This relates to my previous comment. Although the                                                                 |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | supplement trumps the unchanged 87 Manual, I can foresee                                                                       |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | confusion among delineators who must refer to both documents.                                                                  |                                                                                                   |
|        | Greg     |      |           |          | Suggestion: edit the 87 Manual, or make a cross-reference to the                                                               |                                                                                                   |
| 39     | Larson   | 17   | 2         |          | supplement via footnote.                                                                                                       |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | Unless any method can be done RAPIDLY in just a few minutes,                                                                   | There is a general concern that the data be collected in a reasonable amount of time, in a        |
|        |          |      |           |          | then use it, otherwise the time required for other methods, in most                                                            | repeatable fashion, and with some level of accuracy. The working group's selection of             |
|        | James    |      | Dominanc  |          | cases, is just not justifiable economically (budgets) or practically                                                           | indicators and sampling guidance is built on this concept.                                        |
| 40     | Jones    | 17   | e Test    |          | (field time).                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | Procedure. If it fails the dominance test - then it fails the                                                                  | See also response #37. Just like with soils and hydrology, there is more than one indicator       |
|        |          |      |           |          | hydrophytic vegetation parameter. No need to go on unless it is a                                                              | of hydrophytic vegetation. A single vegetation test is not appropriate in all situations just as  |
|        |          |      |           |          | designated problem area. It is possible to meet only two                                                                       | F3 is not appropriate for all soils. Besides reducing the investigator's effort, this sequence of |
|        |          |      |           |          | parameters and not three, particularly if the two parameters are                                                               | vegetation tests is meant to guide the user to the problematic vegetation section in Chapter      |
|        |          |      |           |          | met by using secondary indicators. The question is - Is it a                                                                   | 5, if needed.                                                                                     |
|        | Barbi    |      |           |          | wetland or is it not a wetland. The question should not be - how                                                               |                                                                                                   |
| 41     | 1 Hayes  | 17   |           |          | do we make it a wetland.                                                                                                       |                                                                                                   |
|        | Greg     |      |           |          | Procedure: I like this chronology.                                                                                             | No response is necessary.                                                                         |
| 42     | 2 Larson | 17   |           |          |                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                   |
|        | Stephen  |      |           |          | Procedure (section) - Like the clarity in procedure here                                                                       | No response is necessary.                                                                         |
| 43     | 3 Parke  | 17   |           |          |                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                   |

| Item # | Reviewer           | Page | Paragraph | Sentence  | Comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|--------|--------------------|------|-----------|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 44     | Greg<br>Larson     | 18   |           |           | Procedure for Selecting Dominant Species by the 50/20 Rule:<br>Absolute versus relative cover should be defined. A footnote<br>should suffice.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | We will consider defining both terms in the glossary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|        | James              |      |           | User      | I realize that species not recorded on the regional plant list are usually upland, but there are some plants that are obvious wetland species that are not on the list either (i.e. Cyperus entrerianus). Should they be considered upland?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | These species can be handled under the problematic section (Chapter 5) by verifying 14 days of observed hydrology. We have limited the method to FACU species but those observations combined with best professional judgement could deal with the issue. In general, problems with indicator status should be presented to the appropriate plant list review panel; they are beyond the scope of the regional supplement.                                             |
| 45     | Jones              | 19   | 2         | Notes     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        | Barbi              |      |           |           | Show species in ranking order.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 46     | Hayes              | 19   | table 2.2 |           | g a series and series are series and series and series and series and series and series |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        | Barbi<br>Hayes     | 19   | table 2.2 |           | Should not have minimum cover requirement to be considered separate stratum (see also p. 15). Woody Vine species is the dominant of that stratum - has the highest cover value - if single species then that single species would be dominant and it should be considered.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | The working group does not agree. Not using the 5% cut off allows single species such as vines to be considered dominant with only 1-4 percent cover. The working group has discussed the abuse that could occur when the vegetation decision is close to 50/50 and either a wetland or upland vine is present at low percent cover. The working group concluded that species with such low cover values should not be equally weighted against more dominant species. |
| 48     | Trilety<br>Wade    | 19   | Table 2-2 | Table 2-2 | It appears Region 6 was used to assign indicators to the designated species. However, <i>Panicum virgatum</i> was assigned an indicator of FACW when it is actually assigned an indicator of FAC in Region 5 and Region 6. Switchgrass is only assigned an indicator of FACW in Region 9 - the Northwest. Therefore, the species was assigned an indicator outside the Great Plains. This error would cause a change in the outcome of both the dominance and prevalence calculations.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | We will revise the example and cite the FWS region the ratings are based upon.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        | Barbi<br>Hayes     | 19   |           |           | "must be of species that have been correctly identified" Would not the person think he/she has identified the species correctly?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Good point but sometimes it is necessary to state the obvious. Errors of mis-identification often occur in wetland delineation. The phrase was added to make the point that an effort should be made to correctly identify as many species as possible.                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Greg               |      |           |           | Table 2-2: The percentages of Absolute Percent Cover should be                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 50     | Larson             | 19   |           |           | reordered in decreasing absolute percent cover.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        | Barbi<br>Hayes     | 20   | 1         |           | States the prevalence index is useful in communities with only one or two dominants. Then why not use the dominant test?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | The point here is that decisions based on only one or two dominants (when other species are present) can sometimes lead to erroneous hydrophytic vegetation determinations because too few plants are being considered. A more wholistic approach (e.g., by the prevalence index) might give a more accurate result.                                                                                                                                                   |
| 52     | Gregory<br>Johnson | 20   | 4         |           | There should be a statement inserted here that if the investigator believes a plant species not on the wetland plant list may be hydrophytic then a description of its habitat from a local plant field guide or key should be consulted. I am aware of a few species in WY that are not on the wetland plant list but have habitat descriptions such as "moist areas".                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Those types of issues are dealt with in the problematic section in Chapter 5. We provide techniques to consider FACU species as hydrophytes by observing 14 days of inundation/saturation or with the use of supportive technical literature. We will consider adding wording extending this approach to plants with no indicator. However, revisions to the plant list should be dealt with by regional plant list panels rather than in the supplement.              |
|        | Gregory<br>Johnson | 20   | 4         | 5         | There is a commonly-encountered species in Wyoming (inland saltgrass) that was not assigned an indicator status in Region 4 and has more than one national indicator status. If this procedure was followed, then this species could not be used to assess hydrophytic vegetation even if it comprised 95% of all plant cover.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | This is similar to comment #52 and should be handled in the same fashion.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

| Item # | Reviewer           | Page | Paragraph | Sentence  | Comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--------|--------------------|------|-----------|-----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 54     | Trilety<br>Wade    | 20   | 4         |           | It seems the data will be skewed if only some of the species, rather than all of the species, are included in the prevalence calcuation. There should be no time when a specie(s) is not included because the result will not accurately reflect the existing conditions.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | We agree that the PI will be more accurate if all species are identified and used in the calculation. However, the reality is that some species might not be identifiable at that time of year, or might not have an assigned indicator status. Thus the supplement requires that at least 80% of the cover be identified.                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 55     | Barbi<br>Hayes     | 20   |           |           | Not all species would have to be used in this index. How is that a fair representation?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | See the previous response.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|        | James<br>Jones     | 21   | 3         |           | If we are going to take this approach we need to also take the position that in a site with FACW plants that lacks clear signs of hydrology the FACW plants are functioning as FACU.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | This section of the supplement addresses morphological adaptations which, if present, are clear evidence that the plant has had to deal with saturation in the root zone. However, because most adaptations to wet environments are not outwardly visible, the opposite is not true a FACW plant without observable adaptations cannot be identified as a non-hydrophyte. Besides, it is already inherent in the three-factor approach that areas with no evidence of wetland hydrology will not be identified as wetlands. |
|        | Trilety<br>Wade    | 21   |           | Table 2-3 | The statement above pertains to this Table as well. The product of the FACW species would only be 100 rather than 180 and the product of the FAC species would be 255 rather than 135. The prevalence index is actually 2.93 rather than 2.69. Although it would still satisfy the less than 3 threshold, it is still an incorrect calculation.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | We will revise the example and cite the FWS region the ratings are based upon.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 58     | Barbi<br>Hayes     | 21   |           |           | Morphological adaptations. How many different procedures are you going to apply to try and eke out a positive for vegetation. A field delineator should not be reassigning an indicator status to a species. "Indicator 3" is allowing a FACU to be reassigned as FAC. If that is the case, can a FACW be reassigned to a FAC or a FAC to a FACU? You say a FACU could be functioning as a hydrophyte. Can not a FACW (ie, reed etc) function as a FACU? And then the delineator is to go back and reapply the earlier tests using the new indicator status. Again, sounds like you are trying to broaden the scope of the vegetation parameter. You are tiptoeing a fine line with policy. | See Response #37. Morphological adaptations are used as a hydrophytic vegetation indicator in the 1987 Manual. The supplement actually removes some of the subjectivity from that indicator, making it clear that the entire community must still be considered, not just those species exhibiting the adaptations. It is true that FACW plants, by definition, often grow in nonwetlands. However, the three-factor test ensures that these areas would not be mistaken for wetlands.                                      |
| 59     | Trilety<br>Wade    | 22   | 2         |           | If at first you don't succeed in the dominance and prevalence test then try the morphological adaptations. With the broadened soils and hydrology, this would satisfy the vegetation.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | See responses #37 and 58. Furthermore, we disagree that hydric soil indicators were "broadened" by adopting the NTCHS hydric soil indicators. These indicators are more restrictive and less subject to misinterpretation than those in the 1987 Manual.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        | Stephen<br>Parke   | 22   |           |           | End of page - would be helpful to include a list of morphological adaptations here that are acceptable and/or different from 1987 Manual                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | We provide a list of acceptable ones in the user notes.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 61     | Gregory<br>Johnson | 24   | 3         |           | I'm not sure all the information on texturing soil material belongs this early in this chapter under concepts. I think it would fit better under the section on hydric soil indicators                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | This information is relevant to many of the indicators. Therefore, it is presented early in the chapter.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

| Item # | Reviewer        | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                 | Response                                                                                                                |
|--------|-----------------|------|-----------|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |                 |      |           |          | Cautions: I urge caution concerning any discussion of the               | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                    |
|        |                 |      |           |          | morphology of "relict" versus contemporary and recent features.         | ·                                                                                                                       |
|        |                 |      |           |          | Granted, contemporary and recent redox features have                    |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | boundaries that are generally more diffuse than features (in say) a     |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | long-drained hydric soil. However, we have found that this              |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | distinction is not consistently observed in the field by delineators. I |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | would favor striking the sentence beginning with "Typically,".          |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | Striking this sentence does nothing to detract from the other text      |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | in this paragraph, and the (good) guidance provided on pages 95         |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | and 96 in Section 5. Section 5 correctlyin my viewsuggests a            |                                                                                                                         |
|        | Greg            |      |           |          | landscape approach to resolving confusing soil morphology.              |                                                                                                                         |
| 62     | Larson          | 25   |           |          |                                                                         |                                                                                                                         |
|        | Frank           |      |           |          | I have found it difficult to differentiate contemporary from relict     | See previous comment and response.                                                                                      |
| 63     | Norman          | 26   | 1         |          | hydric soil features at times.                                          |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | Another common temptation is to dig first. I would amend the            | We will add "sample soils" to the second sentence as suggested.                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | second sentence to say: Before any decision to sample soils can         |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | be made, however, the overall site and how it interacts with the        |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | soil should be understood and documented. There is a good               |                                                                                                                         |
|        | Greg            |      |           |          | reason why soils are listed behind vegetation on the data form.         |                                                                                                                         |
| 64     | Larson          | 26   | 1         |          |                                                                         |                                                                                                                         |
|        | Frank           |      |           |          | In Kansas, it is rare to have to dig to a depth of 40 inches or so.     | No response is necessary.                                                                                               |
| 65     | Norman          | 27   | 3         | 5        |                                                                         |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | Digging to a depth of 40-inches seems excessive because of thick        | No response is necessary.                                                                                               |
|        |                 |      |           |          | dark horizons. Wetland soils in this area generally are                 |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | homogenous and consitently adhere to the F6 criteria, or will           |                                                                                                                         |
|        | L               |      |           |          | exhibit redoximorphic features in the upper 12-inches of the soil.      |                                                                                                                         |
|        | Trilety         |      | -         |          | Wetlands are not prairies, and digging deeper than 2-feet seems         |                                                                                                                         |
| 66     | Wade            | 27   | 3         |          | over zealous.                                                           |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | All soils within, on the boundary, and outside the wetland should       | Sampling "all soils" is impractical and unnecessary. The supplement does not prevent                                    |
|        | T-11-4-         |      |           |          | be sampled. If nothing else, the interior soils will provide a          | examination of soils as necessary to determine the boundary; it does suggest where the                                  |
| 67     | Trilety<br>Wade | 20   | 4         |          | biological benchmark for future investigations and/or permitting        | delineator might want to focus effort. No change is necessary.                                                          |
| 67     | vvade           | 29   | 1         |          | activities.                                                             | Most wetlands have indicators throughout but there are exceptions where current indicators                              |
|        | Dorbi           |      |           |          | Why wouldn't you have hydric indicators in the wet interior of a        | Most wetlands have indicators throughout, but there are exceptions where current indicators                             |
| 60     | Barbi<br>Hayes  | 29   | 1         |          | wetland? This paragraph confusing.                                      | fail in very wet areas. See NTCHS Field Indicators of Hydric Soils in the U.S. v6.0 (2006)                              |
| 00     | i layes         | 29   | -         |          | In our conference call, it was noted by a local soils expert that       | page 2 under "Cautions".  True. This indicator could only be used in problem areas in this portion of the region. Don't |
|        | Frank           |      | Vertic    |          | reduced Vertic soils are rare in KS. The use of the dye would           | use the indicator if it is not needed. No change to the document is required.                                           |
| 60     | Norman          | 53   | Section   |          | make for a long delineation (see b.).                                   | use the indicator in it is not needed. No change to the document is required.                                           |
| 09     | Nomian          | 55   | Jection   |          | Indicator F18: Reduced Vertic User Notes: F4 and F5 (second             | We will make the recommended change.                                                                                    |
|        |                 |      |           |          | sentence) should be stricken and replaced with Indicators A11           | will make the recommended change.                                                                                       |
|        | Greg            |      |           |          | and A12 as they were replaced by Field Indicators A11 and A12,          |                                                                                                                         |
| 70     | Larson          | 53   |           |          | respectively.                                                           |                                                                                                                         |
| 10     | _310011         |      |           |          | Hydric Soils Lists: If these data are used, the soil must be            | The point here is that soil survey data should not be used to determine whether the soil is                             |
|        |                 |      |           |          |                                                                         | hydric, whether the soil series is confirmed of not. This is the intent and purpose of the                              |
|        |                 |      |           |          | added that requires the investigator to not infer information solely    | indicators. No change to the document is necessary.                                                                     |
|        |                 |      |           |          | from the soil survey. It may be necessary to sample 40 inches           | J                                                                                                                       |
|        |                 |      |           |          | (100 cm) or more to verify the soil component. The third and            |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          | fourth sentence, paragraph 2, page 85, is also appropriate for          |                                                                                                                         |
|        | Greg            |      |           |          | page 55 at the end of the first paragraph under Hydric Soils Lists.     |                                                                                                                         |
| 71     | Larson          | 55   |           |          | 1 13 17 1 13 77 1 3010 2010                                             |                                                                                                                         |
|        |                 |      |           |          |                                                                         | +                                                                                                                       |

| Item # | Reviewer       | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                 | Response                                                                                     |
|--------|----------------|------|-----------|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |                |      |           |          | Vegetation does not "provide the strongest evidence that wetland        | This sentence merely states the conclusion of the National Academy of Sciences (NRC          |
|        |                |      |           |          | hydrology is present" if the vegetation is a square peg forced to fit   | 1995, p. 92, fifth sentence, and elsewhere). Furthermore, the statement in the supplement    |
|        |                |      |           |          | into a round hole. This statement defies the fact that three            | says "vegetation and soils," not vegetation alone.                                           |
|        |                |      |           |          | separate tests are done for vegetation, two of which are done if        |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | the soils and hdyrology have been satisfied. Therefore, the latter      |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | part of the document should not then state that if vegetation and       |                                                                                              |
|        | Trilety        |      |           |          | soils are present, so should be hydrology.                              |                                                                                              |
| 72     | Wade           | 56   | 1         | 4        |                                                                         |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | Morphological adaptations could be indicators of relict hydropytic      | The reviewer's comment is true. That is why morphological adaptations are not used as        |
|        | Trilety        |      |           |          | vegetation - multi-stemmed trunks do not occur overnight.               | wetland hydrology indicators.                                                                |
| 73     | Wade           | 56   | 1         | 5        |                                                                         |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | When it is stated in this sentence that indicators of hyrophytic        | We do not understand the comment.                                                            |
|        |                |      |           |          | vegetation are evident and hydrology is not, then is it assumed         |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | that said vegetation was determined via the dominance test rather       |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | than the prevalence test. If hydrology is absent, then the              |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | prevalence test is not warranted. However, if a                         |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | delineator/regulator determines the vegetation is hydropytic based      |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | on the prevalence test or morphological adaptations and                 |                                                                                              |
|        | Trilety        |      |           |          | hydrology is absent - then it appears not to be wetland and further     |                                                                                              |
| 74     | Wade           | 56   | 3         | 2        | investigation really isn't necessary.                                   |                                                                                              |
|        | Stephen        |      |           |          | obtain this publication - Steve                                         | No response is necessary.                                                                    |
| 75     | Parke          | 57   | 1         | 3        |                                                                         |                                                                                              |
|        | Gregory        |      |           |          | change Finally, On to Finally, on                                       | We will make the recommended change.                                                         |
| 76     | Johnson        | 57   | 1         | 4        | T                                                                       |                                                                                              |
| 77     | Frank          | 57   | 1         | 4        | Typo: the letter 'O' is capitalized in the word 'On' that is not        | We will make the recommended change.                                                         |
| - //   | Norman         | 5/   | 1         | 4        | beginning the sentence: "Finally, On highly" use lower cap "o" for "On" | Wa will make the recommended shows                                                           |
| 79     | Barbi<br>Hayes | 57   | 1         | 3 full   | luse lower cap o for On                                                 | We will make the recommended change.                                                         |
| 70     | i iayes        | 31   | '         | 3 Iuli   | I think each chapter should start with indicators. The discussion       | For delineators who work in more than one region, it is important to maintain consistency in |
|        | Gregory        |      |           |          | on growing season could be moved to after the indicator                 | the format of regional supplements. This supplement follows the format developed for         |
| 79     | Johnson        | 57   | 2         |          | discussion.                                                             | previous regions.                                                                            |
| - 10   | Barbi          |      | _         |          |                                                                         | The method for on-site determination of the growing season is intended to be used in a       |
| 80     | Hayes          | 57   | 4         |          | of many delineators                                                     | single site visit. However, the information is not needed for most routine delineations.     |
|        | .,             |      |           |          | Section 1 - Reads as if delineators have permission to vary             | The default method involves median growing season dates given in WETS tables. The            |
|        |                |      |           |          | growing season annually based on site conditions as well as to          | alternative on-site approach does indeed result in different growing season dates each year. |
|        |                |      |           |          | calculate growing season against long term WETS data; Might             | The latter approach is "preferred" (see paragraph 3) but isn't needed in most routine        |
|        | Stephen        |      |           |          | want to clarify if this is the case or if one or the other is           | delineations.                                                                                |
| 81     | Parke          | 57   | 5         |          | acceptable.                                                             |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      | _         |          | Growing season; The definition of growing season on 113 does            | The glossary entry on "Growing Season" refers the reader to Chapter 4, where the concept     |
|        |                |      |           |          |                                                                         | lis discussed in detail.                                                                     |
|        |                |      |           |          | This could be fixed by adding more language to the definition or        |                                                                                              |
|        | Greg           |      |           |          | simply providing a cross reference to the section on growing            |                                                                                              |
| 82     | Larson         | 57   |           |          | season.                                                                 |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | The first sentence implies that wetland determinations can be           | There is no such implication. All of these indicators are used as part of a three-factor     |
|        |                |      |           |          | made based on presence of surface water alone. It should be             | approach. This is clear in both the 1987 Manual and this supplement.                         |
|        |                |      |           |          | stated that the other two indicators have to be present even if         |                                                                                              |
|        |                |      |           |          | there is surface water for a wetland determination to be made.          |                                                                                              |
|        | Gregory        |      |           |          | The need for all 3 indicators to be present in most cases should        |                                                                                              |
| 83     | Johnson        | 60   | 2         |          | be emphasized more throughout the manual.                               |                                                                                              |
|        | Barbi          |      |           |          | in some areas the water table is highest during December and            | The comment is true, but we don't understand the reviewer's point. If these are not          |
| 84     | Hayes          | 61   |           |          | January                                                                 | wetlands, they will fail a three-factor test.                                                |
|        | . ,            |      |           |          | <del>!                                    </del>                        | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                                                        |

| Item # | Reviewer               | Page     | Paragraph        | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|--------|------------------------|----------|------------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 85     | Greg<br>Larson         | 62       |                  |          | Saturation: In LRR F, especially the eastern edge, many wetland delineations occur in organic soils. The appearance of "glistening" water as a field indicator of saturation should be limited to mineral soils. A field test of saturation for organic soils is difficult to suggest due to problems calibrating "squeeze" with water content. Hopefully, the supplements for more eastern and northern LRRs will give attention to this matter.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | The reviewer's point is a good one; saturation is difficult to evaluate in organic soils. However, we prefer to leave the decision to the delineator, who has the best understanding of all the conditions on a site.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| - 00   | Laroon                 |          |                  |          | Concern about characterizing this as a primary indicator as                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | This issue was discussed by the working group in light of the Arid West Supplement's                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 86     | Stephen<br>Parke       | 65       |                  |          | duration of hydrology in these areas - flashy - may or may not be sufficient to assume that hydrology is present for long enough                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | classification of this indicator as Secondary for exactly this reason. However, the Great Plains working group felt that the indicator was reliable as a stand-alone indicator when used as part of a three-factor wetland test.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 87     | Frank<br>Norman        | 67       | Iron<br>Deposits | 1&2      | I have seen iron deposits oozing from soils in creeks and wet areas in remediation sites, and wouldn't necessarily want to claim these areas as having iron deposits that are indicative of a primary hydrology. The water may be, so this comment could be moot.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | The discharge of reduced iron shows that the soil is saturated with water that is anaerobic and chemically reduced. This certainly meets the definition of wetland hydrology.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 88     | Trilety<br>Wade        | 68       | 3                |          | Aerial imagery should be included in recorded data but should not be listed as a primary indicator of hydrology. Aerial imagery provides an annual snapshot and is not always verifiable. This should not be weighted as a primary indicator when there are others which are more valid. Aerial imagery should be included in recorded data though.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | This indicator is given the same status (Primary) as the direct on-site observation of surface water. In both cases, the delineator would have to consider whether the condition was normal or represented an extreme event. This caution is given in the User Notes along with a referral to Chapter 5 for procedures to evaluate the normality of precipitation.                                                                                                                                              |
| 89     | Stephen<br>Parke       | 68       |                  |          | Questionable as a primary indicator of hydrology if not substantiated by research normal weather patterns. Sometimes aerial interpertation can be misleading. Might restate the General Description as One or more recent aerial photography or satellite images show the site to be inundated <i>in a normal year</i> .                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | See Response # 88.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 00     | Trilety                | 00       | 0                |          | It is curious water stained leaves has been elevated in rank from                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | No response is necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|        | Wade<br>Greg<br>Larson | 69<br>69 | 3                |          | secondary to primary.  Water-stained leaves: More emphasis should be given to the landscape feature applicable to this indicator. It may appropriate to limit this indicator to depressions and riparian habitats? In LRR F, we have had delineators attempt to use this indicator on upland flats. Used in this setting, it may not warrant status as a primary indicator.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Like many hydrology indicators, water-stained leaves may sometimes be found in nonwetlands. However, the three-factor approach involving indicators of hydric soil, hydrophytic vegetation, <i>and</i> wetland hydrology ensures that these areas will not be mistaken for wetlands.                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 92     | Stephen<br>Parke       | 69       |                  |          | USAEWES.Jan 93. "Literature Review on the Use of Water-Stained Leaves in the Delineation of Wetlands: Wetlands Research Program Technical Notes HY-DE-6.1, Wetlands Research and Technology Center, Vicksburg, MS. states Until more research on the subject (of water stained leaves) yei8lds other pertinent results, it is suggested that water-stained leaves continue to be considered in the delineation process as a secondary hydrologic indicator. I am not aware of additional research and would agree with that there are concerns with duration of hydrology during the growing season. Would suggest maintaining this indicator as a secondary indicator unless new research indicates otherwise. | This comment is well founded. Although there has been little additional "research", another 13 years of regular field application have convinced most delineators of the value of water-stained leaves as an indicator of wetland hydrology, when used as part of a three-factor approach. However, regions differ whether the indicator should be Primary or Secondary. In the relatively dry climate of the Great Plains, the working group felt that water-stained leaves were a reliable Primary indicator. |
| 93     | Gregory<br>Johnson     | 73       |                  |          | Why is sparsely vegetated concave surface a secondary indicator? I think it should work as a primary indicator.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | In the relatively dry climate of the Great Plains, sparsely vegetated surfaces sometimes form as a result of salt accumulation in the soil, independent of wetness at the surface. Thus, the working group gave the indicator a Secondary status.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

| Item # | Reviewer | Page | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                                  | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--------|----------|------|-----------|----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |          |      |           |          | Concern that this is not clearly defined and can be misapplied.                                                                          | The indicator is already restricted to concave landscape positions. It should not require an                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | May want to consider some measure of drainage basin or other                                                                             | analysis of run-off potential into the basin.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|        | Stephen  |      |           |          | source of hydrology that fuels the depressional area in the                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 94     | Parke    | 73   |           |          | definition of this indicator.                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |          | Same comment. I think that drainage patterns should be left as a                                                                         | The working group agreed that this is a valid indicator of surface flow, but were concerned                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |          |      |           |          | primary indicator. This is often the only indicator easily observed                                                                      | about the likelihood of short durations and the possibility of wind-produced indicators on the                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|        |          |      |           |          | in wetlands not related to groundwater but that are inundated early                                                                      | plains.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        | Gregory  |      |           |          | in the growing season due to high water in adjacent streams or                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 95     | Johnson  | 74   |           |          | rivers                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |          | I'm not sure I understand the purpose of this indicator as it is                                                                         | It is very possible to have saturated soil without reduced iron. Both observations are                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        |          |      |           |          | stated here. This sentence states that the presence of ferrous                                                                           | important. The User Note says that the indicator shows that the soil has been "saturated for                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | •                                                                                                                                        | an extended period." No change is necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |          | that is the case why not just use indicator A3? I believe this                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |          | should state that the presence of ferrous iron indicates that the                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Gregory  |      |           |          | soil had been saturated sometime prior to the time of sampling.                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 96     | Johnson  | 77   | 2         | 3        |                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Frank    |      |           |          | During conference call, local soil scientist noted the presence of                                                                       | We don't understand the comment. Does this mean that the site was not wet at the time of                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 97     | Norman   | 77   | 3         |          | ferrous ion in upland soils in playas in KS and Texas.                                                                                   | sampling? Clarification of the issue is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| -      |          |      |           |          | This should be part of hydric soils determination; one would                                                                             | As stated in the supplement, this indicator is strong evidence for current saturation and                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        |          |      |           |          | expect other hydrology indicators to be persistent in an area with                                                                       | anaerobic conditions, which meets the definition of wetland hydrology. The reviewer is                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        |          |      |           |          | these soil conditions. It is probably a better practice to separate                                                                      | confusing the definitions of each factor (hydric soils, hydrophytic vegetation, wetland                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        |          |      |           |          | hydric soil indicators from hydrology indicators for the purposes of                                                                     | hydrology) and indicators of each factor. It is certainly possible for one indicator to represent                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|        |          |      |           |          | scoring. Not a good practice to include hydric soil indicators as                                                                        | more than one factor. However, we agree that most hydric soil indicators would make poor                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|        | Stephen  |      |           |          | hydrology indicators.                                                                                                                    | wetland hydrology indicators due to the possibility of relict soil features. No change is                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 98     | Parke    | 77   |           |          | l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l                                                                                                    | necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|        |          |      |           |          | During conference call, local soil scientist commented that the thin                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Frank    |      |           |          | muck surface is rare in KS, having observed it in some small                                                                             | ,                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 99     | Norman   | 78   | 3         | general  | depressional areas in Reno, KS.                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |          | This is similar if not the same as hydric soil indicator A9. Should                                                                      | See Response # 98. A thin muck surface indicates an ongoing wetland hydrologic regime.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        |          |      |           |          | not utilize hydric soil indicators as hydrology indicators. Would                                                                        | Therefore, it is a reliable indicator of wetland hydrology. No change is necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|        |          |      |           |          | assume that other hydrology indicators or professional experience                                                                        | , ,,                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|        | Stephen  |      |           |          | could be utilized to meet wetland hydrology in these situations.                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 100    | Parke    | 78   |           |          | ,                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Gregory  |      |           |          | Would it make sense to have this as a primary indicator in all                                                                           | One might need to identify areas that were tilled in the past but are no longer being                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 101    |          | 79   | 3         | 1        | areas except tilled crop fields?                                                                                                         | cultivated. The working group will consider the suggestion.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |          | -    |           |          | This indicator can be confusing to use in the field.                                                                                     | (1.) In this case, one would have to use other indicators. (2.) Oxidized rhizospheres can                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        |          |      |           |          | Living roots as a requirement is questionable. Living roots can                                                                          | only form if reduced (ferrous) iron is present in the soil, which rarely occurs in uplands.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |          |      |           |          |                                                                                                                                          | When it does occur, the three-factor approach ensures that these areas will not be mistaken                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |          |      |           |          | developed (but not living) roots.                                                                                                        | for wetlands. (3.) When a living root is present, the indicator reflects <i>recent</i> soil saturation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        |          |      |           |          | 1 \                                                                                                                                      | (i.e., during the life of the plant). Therefore, it meets the requirements of a wetland                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        |          |      |           |          | rhizospheres in upland conditions.                                                                                                       | hydrology indicator. See also Response #98.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        |          |      |           |          | 3. Oxidized rhizospheres are essentially a redoximorphic features.                                                                       | , ,                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|        | Stephen  |      |           |          | As stated above, these should be covered in hydric soils                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 102    | Parke    | 79   |           |          | indicators.                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| .52    |          |      |           |          | Crayfish. We observed an increased number of burrows on                                                                                  | No response or change is necessary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 400    | Barbi    | 00   |           |          | mitigation sites in 2006 over previous years.                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 103    | Hayes    | 80   |           |          |                                                                                                                                          | The section of a second section of the section of t |
|        |          |      |           |          | Question the reliability of this indicator and the need for it.                                                                          | The reviewer's comment is not clear. As he states, the indicator requires field verification                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        | 04       |      |           |          | Signature from aerials can easily be misinterpreted. Field      This is a second to be a signature.  This is a second to be a signature. | that the photo signatures correlate with other evidence of a shallow water table. Thus, it is a                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 104    | Stephen  | 0.4  |           |          | verification is required. (agree with this) This is currently included                                                                   | reliable indicator of soil saturation.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 104    | Parke    | 81   |           | I .      | as other data                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

| Item # | Reviewer                | Page     | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|--------|-------------------------|----------|-----------|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 105    | Gregory<br>Johnson      | 84       |           |          | This page makes reference to plants rated as FAC- and FAC+. I have heard the Corps is going to quit using the + and - qualifiers for plants, at least in Region 9. Does anybody know if this is proposed for other regions as well?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Our National Advisory Team has allowed each region to decide how to use plus and minus modifiers on plant indicator statuses in the Dominance Test. Two western regions, the Arid West and Western Mountains, have decided to disregard the modifiers. They believe that the modifiers have no ecological meaning; many were assigned simply to facilitate plant panel decisions when opinions were split. The Great Plains, however, voted to keep the current system of counting FAC- species among the UPL and FACU species in the Dominance Test. No region uses the plus and minus modifiers in the Prevalence Index. |
| 106    | Greg<br>Larson          | 85       |           |          | Local soil survey data. The statement "must not be hydrologically modified" should be better-explained. (During the review of Chapter 5, I will have more comments on the topic of altered hydrology.) For now, I would suggest adding the following sentence after the one ending in "modified". This indicator hinges on the assumption that the hydrologic and landscape conditions behind the soil survey data have not been altered to the extent that the soil will no longer support a water table within 12 in. (30 cm) of the surface or ponding of flooding for long or very long duration, during the growing season in most years.  Determinations of hydrologic modification may require drainage scope and effect determinations. | The point is well taken. There has been considerable discussion about this indicator. The National Technical Committee for Hydric Soils recommends that soil survey data not be used as an indicator of current hydrology. However, some working groups consider the information to be reliable in their regions. The working group will reconsider the issue, including the reviewer's proposed addition.                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 107    | Trilety<br>Wade         | 86       | 1         | 4&5      | A "Problem" wetland simply sounds like a "Non-wetland" A wetland that " may permanently lack certain indicators due to the nature of the soils or plants species on the site" sounds less like a wetland and more like an upland. No. 77, Section G of Part IV of the 87 Manual provides a better definition of Problem Areas.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | By definition, Problem Area wetlands are <i>wetlands</i> (not uplands) that lack currently identified indicators due to normal environmental variations (i.e., not human alteration) but still meet the basic wetland definition and the definitions of a hydric soil, hydrophytic plant community, and wetland hydrology. Section G of the 1987 Manual is not changed or replaced by this supplement.                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|        | Barbi<br>Hayes          | 86       | 1         |          | If an area permanently lacks a hydrophytic vegetation indicator then maybe it should not be considered a wetland.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | It is correct that all wetlands have hydrophytic vegetation. However, in some wetlands we have difficulty recognizing the adaptations that plants have made for life in saturated soil conditions. If a plant community clearly thrives in an area that is inundated or saturated for long periods during the growing season in most years, it is hydrophytic no matter what its species composition. This section of the supplement gives procedures for identifying the rare situations where such communities do not exhibit standard hydrophytic vegetation indicators.                                                |
|        | Frank                   |          | ·         |          | Italicized sentence says it all for the entire delineation process not                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|        | Norman  Barbi Hayes     | 86<br>86 | 2         | 3        | only problematic wetlands.  A clear statement should be made in this section, as stated in the manual, "This section is not intended to bring nonwetland areas having wetland indicators of two, but not all three, parameters into Section 404 jurisdiction." This should be restated in this supplement.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | There is no need. The supplement does not change or replace this section of the 1987 Manual (see Table 1).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 111    | Trilety<br>Wade         | 87       | 4         | i,ii     | · ·                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | We agree. The supplement was designed to identify wetlands accurately based on a single site visit. In disturbed or problematic situations, this supplement gives guidance for making the most reliable determination possible from a single visit. However, in controversial cases, there may be no option but to revisit the site to verify an earlier decision.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        | Barbi                   |          |           |          | Not always possible to re-examine the site at a later date.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | See Response #111.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        | Hayes<br>Barbi<br>Hayes | 87<br>87 | 4<br>iii  |          | NWI maps are not reliable.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | We recognize the shortcomings of NWI maps for regulatory work. However, they provide another source of information to help make a decision.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

| Item #   | Reviewer       | Page | Paragraph   | Sentence | Comment                                                                                                                | Response                                                                                                                                                                                |
|----------|----------------|------|-------------|----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          | "unvegetated" means no vegetation - it does not mean less than 5                                                       | We clearly define our use of the term in this context. There should be no confusion.                                                                                                    |
| 11       | 14 Hayes       | 88   | b           |          | percent. Consider a better way to state this.                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          | As stated above, be careful if you are trying to use the two-                                                          | No response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 11       | 15 Hayes       | 89   | 5           |          | parameter method.                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | There seems to be an issue with scale in the example figure. I'm                                                       | We prefer to let the delineator make this decision.                                                                                                                                     |
|          |                |      |             |          | not sure what the solution is. For example, it looks like you could                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | also treat the entire area in the photo as a wetland with 5% plant                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | cover rather than just the areas they have circled, which appear to                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | have far more than 5% cover. Perhaps there could be more                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | guidance on when you should try to delineate the vegetated areas                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | Gregory        |      |             |          | vs. when to just call the whole area a wetland based on presence                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 11       | 16 Johnson     | 89   |             |          | of 5% plant cover.                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | <sub>-</sub> . |      |             |          |                                                                                                                        | We do not understand the comment. Wetlands would be delineated as wetlands by the                                                                                                       |
|          | Frank          | 00   | 4           |          | be delineating for wetlands and a conveyance since by its                                                              | three-factor approach. The "conveyance" would likely be delineated by OHW indicators if it                                                                                              |
| 11       | 17 Norman      | 90   | 1           |          | definition a riparian corridor has a watercourse.                                                                      | failed the wetland test.                                                                                                                                                                |
|          | Barbi          | 04   | "0          |          | Again, NWI maps are unreliable and often do not show existing                                                          | We recognize the shortcomings of NWI maps for regulatory work. However, they provide                                                                                                    |
| 1        | 18 Hayes       | 91   | #3          |          | wetlands.                                                                                                              | another source of information to help make a decision.                                                                                                                                  |
|          |                |      |             |          | Basically you are allowing a grazed site to be determined on two                                                       | We cannot reasonably provide fixes for sloppy or deliberately biased wetland delineations.  We expect delineators to act responsibly and follow the complete guidance given in the 1987 |
|          |                |      |             |          | parameters. One can always say an appropriate ungrazed area cannot be located, etc., to justify use of two parameters. | Manual and this supplement. If they did so, a two-factor decision would only be necessary if                                                                                            |
|          |                |      |             |          | l carriot be located, etc., to justify use of two parameters.                                                          | it was impossible to reconstruct the vegetation's unaltered condition. As the 1987 Manual                                                                                               |
|          |                |      |             |          |                                                                                                                        | states (Section F, paragraph 73, step 3) "If it is impossible to determine the plant community                                                                                          |
|          |                |      |             |          |                                                                                                                        | types that occurred on the area prior to alteration, a determination cannot be made using all                                                                                           |
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          |                                                                                                                        | three parameters." The supplement does not change this guidance.                                                                                                                        |
| 1.       | 19 Hayes       | 91   | #4          |          |                                                                                                                        | timee parameters. The supplement does not change this guidance.                                                                                                                         |
| <u> </u> | 13 Hayes       | 31   | <i>π</i> -τ |          | It is not feasible to leave an area fallow for a growing seaon and                                                     | The delineator and land owner must decide what is feasible on a particular site.                                                                                                        |
|          |                |      |             |          | then revisit it at a later date. A full growing season isn't necessary                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | Trilety        |      |             |          | as weedy species will colonize the cleared/plowed area almost                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 12       | 20 Wade        | 92   | 2           |          | immediately.                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          | same as above                                                                                                          | See Response # 119.                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 12       | 21 Hayes       | 92   | #3          |          |                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          | same as above                                                                                                          | See Response # 119.                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 12       | 22 Hayes       | 92   | #4          |          |                                                                                                                        | ·                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|          |                |      |             |          | During conference call, reed canary grass and its growth habit                                                         | We don't understand the comment. This section of the supplement allows the user to                                                                                                      |
|          |                |      |             |          | and response to stress was discussed. Sometimes in some                                                                | consider plant stress in determining the wetland boundary.                                                                                                                              |
|          |                |      |             |          | places (rare occasions) just its morphological appearance (slightly                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          | Frank          |      |             |          | less vigorous or a bit stressed) can be used to delineate the                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 12       | 23 Norman      | 93   | 1           |          | wetland boundary.                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | What are these FACU species that are functioning as                                                                    | By definition, FACU plants are present in wetlands (and, thus, may be functioning as                                                                                                    |
|          |                |      |             |          | 1                                                                                                                      | hydrophytes) up to 33% of the time. Their indicator status is not necessary incorrect. We                                                                                               |
|          | Trilety        |      |             |          | assigned an acurate indicator.                                                                                         | simply need special procedures to identify those unusual instances when FACU plants may                                                                                                 |
| 12       | 24 Wade        | 93   | #3          | #3       |                                                                                                                        | dominate in a wetland.                                                                                                                                                                  |
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          | same concerns as stated above regarding FACU as hydrophyte                                                             | See Response #124.                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 12       | 25 Hayes       | 93   | #3          |          |                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | essentially you are assuming the site is a wetland without the                                                         | The site is clearly a wetland based on direct hydrologic observations. No assumptions are                                                                                               |
|          | Barbi          |      |             |          | vegetation parameter - it is safer to make assumptions about                                                           | involved.                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 12       | 26 Hayes       | 93   | 3a          |          | hydrology (when there is a lack thereof) than vegetation.                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|          |                |      |             |          | Is this evidence of plant vigor/stress of any species not just                                                         | The stress is more likely to be manifested in species that are not well adapted to long                                                                                                 |
|          | Barbi          |      | _           |          | , , ,                                                                                                                  | periods of soil saturation. The supplement gives adequate cautions to avoid situations                                                                                                  |
| 12       | 27 Hayes       | 93   | g3          |          | very misleading.                                                                                                       | where stress may be caused by other factors than wetness.                                                                                                                               |

| Item # | Reviewer | Page | Paragraph | Sentence  | Comment                                                              | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|--------|----------|------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |          |      |           |           | This techincal literature should also be taken into consideration    | The point is a good one. However, the three-factor approach already ensures that such                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|        |          |      |           |           | when FACW species invade upland areas which do not meet soils        | areas will not be mistaken for wetlands.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|        |          |      |           |           | and hydrology, ie <i>Phalaris arundinacea</i> a terrestrial loving   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Trilety  |      |           |           | invasive is often determined by the Corps to indicate the presence   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 128    | Wade     | 94   | 2         | С         | of a wetland.                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |           | how close/far is a "nearby wetland reference area"? If this          | These are decisions that must be made on a case-by-case basis. The final decision rests                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|        |          |      |           |           | paragraph is under "Problematic Hydrophytic Vegetation" then         | with the appropriate Corps District.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|        | Barbi    |      |           |           | how can the wetland in question have substantially the same          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 129    | Hayes    | 94   | 3b        |           | vegetation as the reference site (sentence 1)?                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |           | If hydrology is adequate, soils do not take long to begin exhibiting | The reviewer is correct that soils in some constructed wetlands start to exhibit visible color                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|        |          |      |           |           | hydric indicators. This empirical evidence has been gathered         | changes in as little as two years and may develop fully formed hydric soil indicators in only a                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |           | during the consecutive monitoring of 20+ mitigation sites.           | few years. In these cases, the wetlands could be delineated using indicators and there                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        |          |      |           |           |                                                                      | would be no need to refer to Chapter 5. However, some wetlands may take longer to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 400    | Trilety  | 0.5  | •         |           |                                                                      | develop hydric soil indicators. The caution for recently developed wetlands is still                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 130    | Wade     | 95   | 3         | #4        |                                                                      | appropriate.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        |          |      |           |           | Under step 1 under procedure, it says to verify that one or more     | The guidance is simpler as stated in the supplement.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|        |          |      |           |           | indicators of hydrophytic vegetation are present. Shouldn't this     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |           | state that you should verify the vegetation is classified as         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |           | hydrophytic based on guidance in Chapter 2? Presence of a            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | 0        |      |           |           | FACW species at 5% cover is technically an indicator of              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Gregory  | 96   | 4         |           | hydrophytic vegetation, but it doesn't mean the site would meet      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Johnson  | 96   | 4         |           | that criteria for delineation purposes.                              | This is not a tachnical comment no vacanage is needed                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|        | Barbi    | 97   | last      |           | I love the comment about sunglasses                                  | This is not a technical comment, no response is needed                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 132    | Hayes    | 97   | เสรเ      |           | Hydrology tools. These are good for large scale long term            | No response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|        | Barbi    |      |           |           | projects but not tools that would be regularly used by most          | TNO response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 133    | Hayes    | 101  | е         |           | wetland delineators.                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 133    | i iayes  | 101  | 6         |           | During conference call, the efficacy of the Hydrology Tools was      | The supplement simply lists the Hydrology Tools as an option, particularly for users who may                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|        | Frank    |      |           | hullet no | discussed. It may vary depending on the support of the NRCS          | Inot be familiar with them.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        | Norman   | 101  |           | e.        | office in the area.                                                  | not be familiar with them.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|        | Barbi    | 101  |           | <u>.</u>  | #4 and #6 will give different results                                | Very possibly, given that both methods are approximations of reality. However, if the                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|        | Hayes    | 102  | top list  |           | n i and no min give different results                                | methods are applied correctly, the results should be close.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|        | Frank    |      | 100       |           | Daubenmire, RF (1968) reference: title of book needs to be           | An ERDC editor will make format corrections before publication.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | Norman   | 105  |           |           | capitalized.                                                         | The state of the s |
|        | Trilety  |      |           |           | The data form, with its heavy load of information, is organized well | No response is needed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 137    | Wade     | 117  | data form | data form | and easy to understand and use.                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        |          |      |           |           | Data form. Vegetation. Scientific names are preferred however        | In general, one cannot use the wetland plant lists effectively without knowing the proper                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        |          |      |           |           | common names are just as necessary for those not familiar with       | scientific name.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|        | Barbi    |      |           |           | the other. Even agency personnel do not always know the              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 138    | Hayes    | 117  |           |           | scientific names.                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|        | ,        |      |           |           | Data form. Vegetation. For what are you using percent bare           | This was intended as a check on the total cover of the herb stratum, to help document the                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|        | Barbi    |      |           |           | ground? It is not discussed in the narrative.                        | overall "sparseness" of the herb layer. Adding up the cover values for individual species                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 139    | Hayes    | 117  |           |           |                                                                      | could overestimate total cover due to overlap of plant canopies.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|        |          |      |           |           |                                                                      | • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |

| Item # | Reviewer | Page   | Paragraph | Sentence | Comment                                                             | Response                                                                               |
|--------|----------|--------|-----------|----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|        |          |        |           |          | The Data Form: This concerns Lines 8 and 9 and "significantly       | These two questions are basically the same as those on the old 1992 data form. The     |
|        |          |        |           |          | disturbed" and "naturally problematic" vegetation, soils and        | comment to "explain any answers in Remarks" refers to these questions as well. Further |
|        |          |        |           |          |                                                                     | comments would only clutter an already full form.                                      |
|        |          |        |           |          | reference should be made on the form to refer to "Difficult wetland |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | situations in the Great Plains" part of the supplement. Also, the   |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | form should say "explain in remarks"similar to what is stated for   |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | "Normal Circumstances". One might consider a reference to the       |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | use of Data Form 3 from the unchanged 87 Manual (page B6).          |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | This form is a good one and remains relevant. Its use aids in the   |                                                                                        |
|        | Greg     | 447    |           |          | documentation of disturbances.                                      |                                                                                        |
|        | Larson   | 117    |           |          |                                                                     |                                                                                        |
|        | Barbi    |        |           |          | Data form. Hydrology. Water-stained leaves should be a              | See Response #92.                                                                      |
| 141    | Hayes    | 118    |           |          | secondary indicator not a primary indicator.                        |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | Types and Distribution section. A general comment on saline and     | No response is needed.                                                                 |
|        |          |        |           |          | slope wetlands in eastern NE. I have observed some saline           |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | wetlands change composition due to direct inputs of freshwater      |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | from human activity. Some slope wetlands were "lost" due to no      |                                                                                        |
|        |          |        |           |          | direct connection. Other slope wetlands were lost due to            |                                                                                        |
|        | Barbi    | 7 thru |           |          | development up to their boundaries that changed the hydrology.      |                                                                                        |
| 142    | Hayes    | 9      |           |          |                                                                     |                                                                                        |